

Volume 4, No. 3 Maret 2023

p-ISSN 2721-3854 | e-ISSN 2721-2769

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.46799/jst.v4i3.707>



A COMPARATIVE STUDY BETWEEN THE PAPUA CONTEXTUAL TEXTBOOK (BPKP) AND THE GOVERNMENT PUBLISHED

Felix Degei

University of Adelaide, Australia

Email: felixdegei88@gmail.com

Abstract:

*This paper is a study of two mathematical resources in the Indonesian primary education system. It is an empirical study that will compare the two booklets in the West Papua context. This paper will concentrate on 4 aspects of a contextual analysis framework used the Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS). The 4 aspects used in this study are **structure**, **content**, **expectation** and **language**. In 2013, Wamena Christian Foundation School (WCFS) published the Papua Contextual Textbooks: Buku Paket Kontekstual Papua (BPKP). These textbooks consisted of two subjects Mathematics and Bahasa Indonesia for Grade 1, 2 and 3 at the Primary Schools. This research examines the resource “Buku Paket Kontekstual Papua” (BPKP) which was designed by Wamena Christian Foundation School (WCFS) and the other resource “Matematika Untuk SD/MI Kelas 1” (MTG1_DH) which is the government issues resource designed by Djaelani and Haryono in 2008. The purpose of these textbooks is to uplift the education outcome from Indigenous Papuans in literacy and numeracy. After many good results from testing the Governor of West Papua and The Head of Education and Cultural Department ordered all school to utilise the BPKP textbook for the delivery of maths instruction. This paper will examine the difference later in the paper. What also will be examined is why this was so? The Governor of West Papua and the Head of Education and Cultural Department ordered the usage of BPKP resource without any empirical evidence to support him excepting the testing results. In using the textbook analysis process the research was able to identify significant differences in all areas of the textbook analysis. Through this process, the research will TIMSS definition of what a textbook analysis should consist of TIMSS identify 4 areas that make a good textbook analysis. The **structure** requires you to incorporate reference, substitution, ellipsis, conjunction and lexical when examining books. **Content** has 4 factors that define an analysis. These are motivation, comprehension cues, technical aids and philosophical position. **Expectation** requires empathy and philosophy. **Language** examines the narration and description aspect of a text. This analytical research paper will highlight the significant difference between the two resources and the effect it has on the West Papuan learners of Mathematics in the Primary School grades of 1, 2 & 3.*

Keywords: *Contextual Textbook; Comparative Study; Primary School; Indigenous Education; Textbook Analysis.*

INTRODUCTION

West Papua (formerly Irian Jaya) is the western half of the Island of New Guinea. The West Papua borders with Papua New Guinea. To the north lies the Pacific Ocean, to the west is the Arafura Sea and to the south is Australia. The physical area of Papua is 421,981 square kilometres and lies between 130°–141° East Longitude and 2°25 South Longitude – 9° North Longitude.

The name of West Papua itself has changed over time. For example, during Dutch colonisation, the island was called Netherland New Guinea. Then it was renamed Irian Jaya since the Government of Indonesia started to take formal control, ((Price & Rogers, 2019) However, in 2001 when Irian Jaya was decentralised, the name of it also changed into Papua simultaneously.

Topographically West Papua consists of three main areas including the birds head, the central highlands within the northern and the Southern Jayawijaya highlands. The birds head region includes Manokwari, Fak-Fak, Teminabuan, Stenkool, Kaimana, Kokas, Ayamaru and Windesi. The central highland and the northern region includes Jayawijaya, Mamberamo, Cenderawasih Bay and Jayapura. The southern region of Jayawijaya mountain is Merauke (Elazzabi & Kaçar, 2018; Elmslie & Webb-Gannon, 2013; Ipenburg, n.d.; Mulryan, 1984)

The inhabitants of West Papua emigrated from Asia during the last ice age, nearly 50,000 years ago. They consisted primarily of three groups: Negritos, Papuans and Melanesians who are today categorized as a single race, Melanesians, (Amirudin & De Soares, 2003) Until today none of the research identifies the exact number of indigenous tribes in West Papua. However, according to the research from Cenderawasih University and The Summer Institute of Linguistics (SIL) International Sentani (Sianturi et al., 2022) and Ethnologue (Mukundan, 2007) identified there are 276 local languages spoken in West Papua. Therefore, it is assumed that there are probably more than 270 indigenous Papuan who have been living in West Papua.

Since the first Melanesians arrived in Papua until the Dutch colonial era in 1828, the indigenous people of Papua lived very dependently on the nature (Anderson, 2013). The education system in West Papua was dominated by the traditional education system. The types of work they did to survive such as farming, fishing, hunting, growing vegetables and planting fruit (Okeeffe, 2013) In addition, the process of transferring knowledge and skills is only done verbally in everyday life (non- formal ways). There were no schools or institutions where students could get as much knowledge as possible. The main sources of knowledge at that time was parents' memories, customs, beliefs related to the surrounding environment including rivers, lakes, seas, oceans, forests, trees, mountains and valleys. Houses for men are used to build separately from women's houses so that only boys can live and live in women's homes. Thus, during that time, Melanesians lived mostly nomadically moving from one place to another until the Dutch colonial period.

In the Educational Sector, both the Protestant and Catholic churches played the pivotal roles in educating Papuans. They built many foundation schools. Some are even still existing until

today and managed by a specific religious body. For example, the Protestant Educational Foundation (YPK) which supported by the Christian Church and the Catholic Educational School (YPPK) supported by the Roman Catholic Church (Lampert et al., 2014)

Many Papuans are well-educated from Christian primary to high schools. The subjects that are being taught were mostly related to the vocational education subjects including farming, fishing and motor mechanics. the Dutch also established the Pan-Papuan Principle in order to raise up the Papuan's self-esteem and self-dignity in combating the nationalist propaganda of President Sukarno in the early 1960s (Horsley & Laws, 1992). Therefore, the evolution of Papuan nationalism has gone hand in hand with this Dutch created nation building mantra ((Miller, 2015)

During the Suharto regime, the Indonesian government greedily exploited the natural resources while ignoring the development of the local community. For example, the central government took over 3.82 million hectares of ancestral lands of the Amungme and Kamoro tribes for PT Freeport Indonesia without any permission (Brundige et al., 2004)

Despite the BPKP have published and used since 2013 none of either person or institution conducting the research due to this. Whereas those textbooks have a significant influence on students' achievement. The real triggers that emerge behind these prestigious achievements still remain mysterious. People might curious about this fact then raising many questions. There are two possible questions that many people possibly asked. First, why using BPKP has a significant impact on students' achievement than other books? Second, what are the similarities and differences from those two books? To address on such matter, it is applicable and doable using research that explores some pivotal aspects in teaching and learning. The textbook analysis is one of the most suitable research methods that emphasises on at least two crucial aspects in teaching. First, concern with the pedagogical implication of the text: how are textbooks used by teachers and received by students? Second, in regard to the content of 'the text itself': what is included in the text, what is omitted and why?

Unfortunately, there is no sufficient time to do such intensive and depth research. However, it can be done by conducting a simpler research method. For example, doing a comparative study on two books that have been using in the primary schools in Papua. Thus, the research intends to do a comparison between Mathematics Textbook Grade 1 at the primary school from BPKP and MTG1_DH in Papua. The aspects that emphasise on this research based on the four key elements in Mathematics Textbook Analysis (structure, content, expectations and language) from *the Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS)* (Hamadi, 2017). This research focuses on Mathematics Textbooks for Grade 1 in Primary Schools in Papua. There are two books that are compared: Mathematics Textbooks from BPKP (2015) and the Government Published which written by (Tandamat, 2022). The aims of this study to: Explore the similarities and dissimilarities between those two Mathematics Textbooks, Identify similarities and dissimilarities between those two Mathematics Textbooks, Compare and contrast between two Mathematics Textbooks based on four key elements in Mathematics Textbook Analysis from TIMSS 1995, Provide some of the recommendations due to revitalise, revise or modify the framework of the textbook based on the contextual need.

METHOD

The aim of this research is to explore and identify the similarities and differences and then continue comparing and contrasting between the BPKP and MTG1_DH. More specifically we will focus on the Mathematics Textbook for Grade 1 at the Primary School. This comparative study is considered to be an applicable research approach as it emphasises on the comparison within and across each context, (Goodrick, 2014). This research approach undertakes an in-depth analysis and syntheses among the similarities, differences and patterns within and across two or more objects that are being observed, (Pickvance, 2005). Due to time constraints in the research, the researcher can only examine the comparative study instead of using the experimental or quasi-experimental research design approach.

According to Goodrick, D. (2014) in order to understand each aspect of the textbook a researcher needs to design an analytical framework that will act as a guide in the cross aspect comparison. As this research intends to compare the Mathematics Textbooks used in the primary school. The four main aspects of the Third International Mathematics and Science Studies (TIMSS) adapted the guidance in order to explore and identify both differences and similarities, (G. Valverde, et al 2002).

In the analysis section of this research, this study draws on the four key aspects of TIMSS (structure, content, expectation and language) in order to conduct this comparative study. Structure Analysis focuses on the question: how do the BPKP and MTG1_DH textbook structured? Content Analysis focuses on the question: what are the topics and aspect of materials covered in the BPKP and MTG1_DH textbook? Expectation Analysis focuses on the question: what is expected after utilizing the BPKP and MTG1_DH textbook? The fourth, Language Analysis focuses only on the question: what is the type of language used as a medium instruction in the BPKP and MTG1_DH textbooks?

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Comparing and Contrasting

The critical analysis of the BPKP and MTG1_DH is carried out based on four aspects of the TIMSS textbook analysis framework (*structure, content, expectation and language*). Every aspect has created one question. This analysis is completed based on the findings of the answers to each of the questions which have been summarized in the form of a table. The main purpose of this analysis is to identify similarities and differences and do a comparison between the BPKP and MTG1_DH.

Structure

A study from the structural aspects both BPKP and MTG1_DH have several similarities but also dissimilarities. In general, both textbooks consist of three major parts, introduction, contents and the conclusion. At the beginning part of the book, either BPKP or MTG1_DH have similarities in terms of cover, preamble, book usage instructions and a list of content. However, there are some dissimilarities between those two books. For example, the BPKP has the forewords from the Governor of Papua, recommendations from both the governor and the head of the educational department in Papua, a form of the book and standard of assessment and

evaluation. Meanwhile, the MTG1_DH has an opening speech by the publisher and the strategy for student learning.

In the contents section, both BPKP and MTG1_DH have the similar intention which is to introduce the numbers, addition and subtraction in Mathematics. Nevertheless, both books have huge dissimilar in terms of how the contents of books organised. The BPKP splits the learning material in the form of a month hence there are ten months for a year of study. Therefore, the semester one started from the first month until the fifth month while the sixth to ten months are included in the second semester. Whilst, the MTG1_DH consists of seven chapters, the chapters one to four for semester one and chapters five to seven for semester two. Though at the end of the book both BPKP and MTG1_DH provide references and MTG1_DH uses an additional glossary.

Content

Although the BPKP and MTG1_DH coverage the same subject matter, namely introducing the numbers, addition and subtraction to students at the primary school grade 1, there are some extremely different aspects due to the total number of the books designed and produced. The BPKP utilises six textbooks in one year which consisting of two teachers' handbooks, two students' worksheet books and two test booklets for each semester. The MTG1_DH on the other hand only utilise two books, one teacher 'handbook and students' worksheet book. The teachers 'handbooks and students' worksheet books in both BPKP and MTG1_DH have the same function which covers all the lessons that are going to be taught by teachers in the classroom and all the exercise questions for students while the booklet test in BPKP only contains test questions for students.

The BPKP is designed materials in the form of the lesson plan and divided into months similar to chapters on the MTG1_DH. In one year of study, BPKP has 10 months and ought to spend 200 lesson plans. Every semester BPKP has 5 months and 100 lesson plans. So, practically 20 lesson plans for every month. While MTG1_DH only has 7 chapters in one year. So, the chapters 1 to 4 for semester one and chapter 5 to 7 for semester two.

Interestingly, the BPKP uses practical topics related to everyday life. For example, school, family, health, animal, village, profession, health, environment and transportation. Meanwhile, in MTG1_DH uses theoretical topics such as Whole Numbers 0 to 20, Addition and Subtraction of Numbers, Time and Length Unit, Geometry, The value of place and usage, Unit of Weight and Plane. For the assessment and evaluation, BPKP conducts the affirmative test every two weeks or after 20 lesson plans completed. The first-semester exam is conducted after five months and the second- semester exam is conducted after ten months. While MTG1_DH, on the other hand, conducts the affirmative test at the end of every chapter. The first-semester exam is carried out after four chapters finished and the second semester or final exam conducted after the whole seven chapters completed.

There are two core activities in every lesson plan in the BPKP. First, an introduction which discusses intentions of the lesson plan regarding cognitive aspects, affective and psychomotor, keywords, tools and material as well as time preference provided. Second, the four main activities in the lesson plan such as opening, explanation, exercises and closing. While in MTG1_DH has three essential aspects including how to read the cover of each chapter, map of

concept, keywords, apperceptions, teaching materials, pictures, practice items, assignments, summary, reflection, competencies, activities, information media and final semester tests.

Expectation

The main objective desired to be achieved through the use of the BPKP and MTG1_DH is to meet national education goals by implementing the basic and standards competencies. The authors of both the BPKP and MTG1_DH expect that students will actively be involved in the affirmative and summative test in order to recognise their progress in learning mathematics. There are two objectives that only possessed in the BPKP, first, each lesson plan has three aspects of ability that expected to be achieved by students according to the topic including cognitive, affective and psychomotor. In addition, BPKP also aimed to shape positive relationships through simple language and examples which is real to students' life (*realistic mathematics*).

Language

One outstandingly different aspect between the BPKP and MTG1_DH is language. All the lesson plans in BPKP utilise simple language that can be easily understood by both teachers and students while in MTG1_DH use the Indonesian language which standardised and academic for whole Indonesia. The images used in BPKP also taken from everyday life, especially in Papua, while MTG1_DH used the images for the same general example for whole schools in Indonesia regardless of diversities. Moreover, games, songs and stories are also imitated from the child's daily life in Papua. Unlike in MTG1_DH which is used from the same source to be applied in whole Indonesia. In addition, the BPKP implement the repetition system of basic things in a fun way through singing, dancing and storytelling in order to strengthen students' understanding.

Discussion and Valuing Indigenous Knowledge

The purpose of this study was to explore and identify the similarities and differences in terms of four aspects from TIMSS (structure, content, expectation and language) between the BPKP and MTG1_DH. In chapter four has discussed the findings and critical analysis by comparing and contrasting between the BPKP and MTG1_DH. The result of the study reveals that there are huge differences between these two textbooks. Although there are still some similarities emerged particularly regarding the intention of textbooks usage. This part, therefore, reviews rigorously each textbook separately with a focus on the research questions. There are two core research questions formed in order to accomplish the research objectives.

The research question 1: How are the Mathematics Textbook for Grade 1 Primary Schools by BPKP published by WCFS and MTG1_DH published the Government (designed in terms of structure, content, expectations and language?

BPKP

Structurally, BPKP has three parts including introduction, content and conclusion. The introductory section consists of cover pages, forewords by the governor of Papua, recommendation by the governor of Papua and the head of the educational department, preamble, book usage instruction, form of the book, the standard of assessment and evaluation, contains and aims to the National Curriculum 2013. The content section contains 200 lesson plans divided into 10 months each for 5 months for the first semester and 5 months for the second

semester. Each month's the teaching material consists of the mathematical outline, the mathematical wall, a total of ten lesson plans, test registration form for the previous lesson plan, ten lesson plans and test registration forms for the previous material. The conclusion section contains a list of references being used in the writing of BPKP. In short, all the lessons in the BPKP are arranged in the form of lesson plans.

In terms of content, BPKP coverages the lessons to introduce students with numbers, addition and subtraction. The BPKP has six textbooks for one year. Each semester has three different textbooks including teachers' handbook, students' worksheet book and test booklet. The teachers' handbook covers all the lessons that are going to be taught in the classroom. The students' worksheet contains all the items for exercises to practice individually and the test booklet designed for the final test both formative and summative assessment. The content of the lesson in BPKP is designed in the form of the lesson plan. The topic for every lesson plan has simplified to the practical Thematic topics such as School, Family, Village, Health, Animal, Family, Profession, Games, Environment, and Transportation. Every month has 20 lesson plans which divided into 10 lesson plans for every two weeks (fortnight). In total, there are 100 lesson plans in one semester that need 70 minutes for one lesson plan and 200 lesson plans for one year. After finishing 10 lesson plans, students are given a formative test. Hence, in one month there are two times for the formative test. In addition, there are two core parts in each lesson plan of the BPKP. Firstly, the introduction which discusses the intentions of the lesson plan regarding cognitive aspects, effective and psychomotor, keywords, tools and material as well as time preference provided. Secondly, four main activities in the lesson plan, namely: opening, explanation, exercises and closing. In short, all material contained in BPKP is designed in accordance with the context of the environment, stories and culture of Papua and all use practical topics.

Likewise, other textbooks, BPKP has some expectations. The main objective of the BPKP is to fulfil the national educational goals through the curriculum even though the content designed specifically for Papua context. Interestingly, every lesson plan in BPKP has three skills that are expected to be achieved by students including cognitive, affective and psychomotor. Moreover, students are also expected to undertake the formative and summative to recognise the learning progressive in Mathematics. In addition, BPKP has a unique intention which is to build up the positive relationships by applying simple language level of language. To sum up, the BPKP designed all material as creative as simple in nature with the hope that students can swiftly associate the learning material to their real life.

Language is one of the most unique and different aspects used in BPKP. There are three concepts that indicate the difference between BPKP and the government published textbooks. Firstly, all lesson plans in BPKP employ very simple language. Secondly, the images used are taken from everyday life, especially in Papua, and Thirdly, games, songs and stories are also imitated from the child's daily life in Papua. In addition, BPKP applies a method of repetition of basic things in a fun way through singing, dancing and storytelling in order to strengthen students' understanding. In brief, BPKP utilises a very simple level of language that can be understood easily by both teachers and students.

MTG1_DH

Structurally, MTG1_DH has three parts including introduction, content and conclusion. The introductory section consists of a cover page, opening Speech, preamble, book usage instructions, strategy for student learning and list of content. The content section, MTG1_DH has seven chapters of discussion, chapters one to four for semester one and chapters five to seven for semester two. While the closing section contains a list of references used as well as a glossary. In short in MTG1_DH all learning materials are arranged in the format of chapters and sub-chapters.

The content of MTG1_DH generally discusses the lesson to introduce students with number numbers, addition and subtraction. MTG1_DH has two textbooks for one year (teachers 'handbook and students' worksheets book). The teachers 'handbook contains the lessons that are going to be taught in the classroom while students' worksheet covers the items for students' individual exercises and homework. The content in MTG1_DH is designed in the form of the chapters. All chapters are arranged with theoretical topics such as whole numbers 0 to 20, addition and subtraction of numbers, time and length units, geometry, the value of place and usage, unit of weight and plane. Furthermore, the MTG1_DH consists of seven chapters for one year which is the chapter 1-4 for the first semester and chapters 5-7 for the second semester. In addition, there are many important aspects in the MTG that need to pay attention to teachers in each chapter such as how to read the cover of each chapter, map of concept, keywords, apperceptions, teaching materials, pictures, practice items, assignments, summary, reflection, competencies, activities, information media and final semester tests. In conclusion, MTG1_DH content is compiled with theoretical topics with the same sources to be applied to the whole of Indonesia.

The MTG1_DH writers have acknowledged that the main purpose of the MTG1 is to fulfil the national educational goals by the curriculum. In addition, students are practically expected to carry out the test questions at the end of each chapter as a formative assessment in order to know the learning progressive. At the end of the semester, students are expected to undertake the final semester test as a summative test to determine the general understanding of the MTG1_DH. In summary, the intention of the MTG1_DH is to fulfil the national goals through applying the national curriculum which comprised into the basics and standard competencies.

Due to language aspect, all lesson in MTG1_DH uses the standard Indonesian Bahasa language. It can be seen clearly in the images which adapted from everyday life in general for whole Indonesia. Moreover, games, songs and stories adapted from the child's life in general for whole Indonesia regardless of students' diversity due to culture, ethnicity as well as belief.

The research question 2: What are the similarities and differences in terms of structure, content, expectations and language between Mathematics Textbook for Grade 1 Primary Schools published by WCFS (BPKP) and The Government Published (MTG1_DH) in Papua?

Structure

From the structural aspect, BPKP and MTG1_DH have several similarities but there are also some differences. Both BPKP and MTG1_DH have three main parts, introduction, content and closing. The introductory section, both books cover, preamble, book usage instructions and list of content. However, there are some variances between these two books. For example, BPKP has an introduction from the Governor of Papua, recommendations from both governor and

heads of education and cultural affairs in Papua, book forms and assessment standards and evaluation methods. Meanwhile, MTG1_DH has an opening speech by publishers and learning strategies for students.

Both BPKP and MTG1_DH have arranged in a different manner. The BPKP compiles each learning material designed and structured in the form of lesson plans which divided into months. There are 200 lesson plans for a year of study which need to spend in 10 months. Hence, every semester consists of 100 lesson plans for 5 months. Whilst, the MTG1_DH structures the learning material in the form of chapters. There are seven chapters which comprised into chapters. The chapter one to four for semester one and chapters five to seven for semester two. In the final section, BPKP and MTG1_DH both provide references but MTG1_DH uses a glossary in addition.

Content

The main objectives of BPKP and MTG1_DH are to introduce numbers, additions and reductions for grade 1 students at the primary school. However, there are several very different aspects between these two textbooks:

Firstly, BPKP uses six textbooks in one year consisting of two teacher handbooks, two student worksheets and two test books for each semester. Meanwhile, MTG1_DH only uses two books, one teacher handbook and a student workbook. The teacher handbook and student workbooks at BPKP and MTG1_DH have the same function which includes all the lessons that the teacher will teach in class and all the practice questions for students while the small book test in BPKP only contains questions for students.

Secondly, BPKP designs materials in the form of lesson plans and is divided into months similar to the chapters in MTG1_DH. In one year of study, BPKP has 10 months and must spend 200 lesson plans. Every semester BPKP has 5 months and 100 lesson plans. So, practically 20 lesson plans for each month. While MTG1_DH only has 7 chapters in one year. So, chapters 1 to 4 for semester one and chapters 5 to 7 for semester two.

Thirdly, BPKP uses practical topics related to everyday life. For example, school, family, health, animal, village, profession, health, environment and transportation. Meanwhile, in MTG1_DH uses theoretical topics such as Full Numbers 0 to 20, Addition and Subtraction of Numbers, Time and Length of Unit, Geometry, Value of place and usage, Weight and Plane Units.

Fourthly, for assessment and evaluation, BPKP conducts affirmative tests every two weeks or after 20 lesson plans are completed. The first semester exam is conducted after five months and the second semester exam is conducted after ten months. While MTG1_DH, on the other hand conducts an affirmative test at the end of each chapter. The first semester exam is conducted after four chapters are completed and the second semester or final exam is conducted after all seven chapters are completed. In summary, all the lesson plans in BPKP constructed in accordance to indigenous Papuans context and more practical topics used. Whilst, MTG1_DH compiled all the teaching content based on urban lifestyle and more theoretical topics employed to be applied to whole Indonesia.

Expectation

In general, both BPKP and MTG1_DH have the same main objectives to meet the national education goals through the application of basic and standards competencies. In addition, students are also expected to take the final semester exams, both formative and summative tests to determine the development of learning particularly mathematics. BPKP specifically has two objectives. Firstly, each lesson plan has three aspects of skills to be achieved; cognitive, affective and psychomotor. Secondly, BPKP also aims to create positive relationships through simple language, images, games, songs, stories and dances that are real for students' lives (realistic mathematics). In short, the teaching and learning steps in BPKP constructed as creative as simple in nature which closed to students' lives in order to maintain a good relationship between and among teachers as well as students.

Language

Language is one of the most distinctive aspects of BPKP and MTG1_DH. For example, all lesson plans in BPKP applies a very simple and easy level of language which is understood by both teachers and students while MTG1_DH uses standard and academic language to be applied in whole part of Indonesia. In addition, the images, games, songs and stories used in BPKP are closely related to the indigenous Papuan's daily lives. While MTG1_DH uses examples, which are general to be used to whole Indonesia regardless of diversities. Interestingly, BPKP applies a system of repetition of basic things in a fun way through singing, dancing and telling in order to strengthen students' understanding. In brief, BPKP in each lesson plan uses a very simple level of language while MTG1_DH applies standard and academic language to be applied to whole Indonesia.

From the discussion above studied that the BPKP textbooks have a strong interrelated connection with several influential learning theories and the ideal teaching philosophy behind indigenous students. For example, BPKP textbooks applied the Experiential Learning Theories (ELTs) from David A. Kolb (1948) (Sternberg & Zhang, 2000). The ELT refers to two types of experiences: Concrete Experience (CE) and Abstract Conceptualization (AC) and two dialectically related modes of transforming experiences, Reflective Observation (RO) and Active Experimentation (AE). The ELT is applied through four learning cycles: diverging for generating ideas, assimilating for the wide range of information understanding and putting them in a concise manner, converging practical findings for ideas and theories and accommodating for learning from primarily 'hands-on' experience. These values are clearly seen in the BPKP whether in structure, content, expectations as well as language.

The BPKP resource textbook also has implemented several important educational values that must exist in indigenous education. For example, maintaining regular engagement, recognizing the role of children, understanding their culture and having positive paradigms for children in order to maintaining and nurturing reciprocal and meaningful relationships between indigenous children and their parents (Colbung, Glover, & Hill, 2010). Since fathers' involvement particularly has a significant influence on indigenous students' literacy skills (Colbung, Glover, & Hill, 2011). Indigenous students are capable to achieve successful education unless the learning environments are

culturally affirmative and inclusive of their specific learning needs (Price, 2012). In partnership with Aboriginal Children, (Colbung & Glover, 2013) highlight there are four aspects that should be shown by teachers in teaching indigenous students: approachability, warmth,

fairness and loudness. Besides that, there are four initiatives which should be included: bringing local and national identity to the school, inviting the role model to school, using the volunteer to come and share experiences and applying work experiences scheme. These indigenous education values are obviously employed in BPKP textbooks.

Thus, the design of this BPKP can be used as a guideline in the collection of books specifically for the benefit of indigenous people. The right of indigenous people to get a good education in accordance with their own culture, language and history has been regulated in the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (chap. 7 art. 15 (1) & art. 16 (1) (AHRC, 2018). It is also stated on the Indonesia National Education System Law 20 of 2003 art. 1 point (16) and art. 55 point (1), ACDP (2014b, p. 112). So that all indigenous people have the right to make their own learning media according to the needs of their respective regions. For example, Inuit in Canada, Maori in New Zealand, Aboriginal in Australia, 'Jungle School' for Indonesia in Sumatra and BPKP for Indigenous Papuans.

CONCLUSION

This comparative study is undertaken to explore, identify and then compare and contrast between the two textbooks utilised in West Papua. The research is focused on the Mathematics Textbooks for Grade 1 at the Primary School in Wamena West Papua. The textbooks that are chosen as the object of research namely the textbooks designed by the Wamena Christian Foundation (WCFS-2015) "The Papua Contextual Textbook: Buku Paket Kontekstual Papua (BPKP) and the Government Published: "Matematika Untuk SD/MI Kelas 1" (MTG1_DH) which is designed by Djaelani and Haryono (2008). The main reason for choosing these textbooks as the object of the research is that both textbooks used are for Mathematics focussing on grade1. Both textbooks have the same purpose which is to fulfil the national education goals. The main reason was to compare and contrast any difference between the two resources and secondly to investigate why one achieved better results than the other. The eventual result of the study revealed that the BPKP has a significant impact on its indigenous students' literacy and numeracy skills. Moreover, these findings are expected to provide benefits to various parties especially to those who are directly involved in implementing the special education for indigenous people. In particular the implementation and design of successful resource teaching resources for the special purposes for its indigenous students, their parents and their community. This is essential since 'One Size does not Fit All.'

BIBLIOGRAPHY

-
- Amirudin, & De Soares, A. J. (2003). *Perjuangan Amungme: antara Freeport dan militer*. Elsam.
- Anderson, B. (2013). The failure of education in Papua's highlands. *Inside Indonesia*, 113, 1–7.
- Brundige, E., King, W., Vahali, P., Vladeck, S., & Yuan, X. (2004). Indonesian human rights abuses in West Papua: Application of the law of genocide to the history of Indonesian control. *New Haven: Allard K. Lowenstein Internationaal Human Rights Clinic, Yale Law School*.

- Elazzabi, A. A. K., & Kaçar, A. (2018). A Comparative Analysis of Ratio and Proportion Problems in Libyan and Turkish Mathematics Textbooks. *International Journal of Educational Studies in Mathematics*, 5(4), 132–139.
- Elmslie, J., & Webb-Gannon, C. (2013). A slow-motion genocide: Indonesian rule in West Papua. *Griffith Journal of Law & Human Dignity*, 1(2).
- Hamadi, H. (2017). Study on the Development of Education: Contextual Secondary Education in Papua. *Journal of Education and Vocational Research*, 8(1), 12–16.
- Horsley, K., & Laws, M. (1992). Education equality? Textbooks in New South Wales government and non-government secondary schools. *Curriculum Perspectives*, 12(3), 7–17.
- Ipenburg, A. (n.d.). *Congress 'Education in Papua', Gau, Friesland, The Netherlands*.
- Lampert, J., Burnett, B., Martin, R., & McCrea, L. (2014). Lessons from a face-to-face meeting on embedding Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander perspectives: 'A contract of intimacy.' *Australasian Journal of Early Childhood*, 39(1), 82–88.
- Miller, M. G. (2015). Consultation with Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people in early childhood education: The impact of colonial discourses. *The Australian Educational Researcher*, 42(5), 549–565.
- Mukundan, J. (2007). Evaluation of English language textbooks: Some important issues for consideration. *Journal of NELTA*, 12(1), 80–84.
- Mulryan, C. (1984). Effective communication of mathematics at primary level: Focus on the textbooks. *Irish Educational Studies*, 4(2), 62–81.
- Okeeffe, L. (2013). *A framework for textbook analysis*.
- Price, K., & Rogers, J. (2019). *Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander education*. Cambridge University Press.
- Sianturi, M., Chiang, C.-L., & Sumarsono, A. (2022). The preservation of the identity and culture of the Indigenous Lanninese people of West Papua, Indonesia, through education (Preservación de la identidad y la cultura del pueblo Lani, comunidad indígena de la provincia Indonesia de Papúa Occidental, a través de la educación). *Culture and Education*, 34(2), 424–465.
- Tandamat, N. (2022). *Application of the United Nations Framework of Analysis for Atrocity Crimes: The Case of West Papua*.

Copyright holder:
Felix Degei (2023)

First publication right:
[Jurnal Syntax Transformation](#)

This article is licensed under:

